

NEWARK AND SHERWOOD DISTRICT COUNCIL

Minutes of the Meeting of **Planning Committee** held in the Civic Suite, Castle House, Great North Road, Newark, Notts, NG24 1BY on Tuesday, 6 November 2018 at 4.00 pm.

PRESENT: Councillor D Payne (Chairman)
 Councillor P Handley (Vice-Chairman)

Councillor Mrs K Arnold, Councillor R Blaney, Councillor Mrs C Brooks,
Councillor B Crowe, Councillor Mrs M Dobson, Councillor J Lee,
Councillor Mrs P Rainbow, Councillor F Taylor, Councillor Mrs L Tift,
Councillor I Walker, Councillor B Wells and Councillor Mrs Y Woodhead

APOLOGIES FOR Councillor P Duncan
ABSENCE:

108 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS AND OFFICERS

Councillor Mrs M Dobson declared a Personal Interest in Agenda Item No. 10 – 9 The Paddocks, Newark (18/01402/FUL) as the applicant was known to her.

Councillor D.R. Payne, I. Walker and B. Wells declared Personal Interests in Agenda Item No. 9 – Land Adjacent Bramley House, Burnmoor Lane, Eglington (18/00787/FUL) as they were Members of the Trent Valley Internal Drainage Board.

Councillor Mrs P Rainbow declared a Personal Interest in Agenda Item No. 16 – Land to the Rear of Franklyn, Lower Kirklington Road, Southwell (18/01711/FUL) as the applicant was her neighbour.

109 DECLARATION OF ANY INTENTIONS TO RECORD THE MEETING

The Chairman informed the Committee that the Council was undertaking an audio recording of the meeting.

110 MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

The Committee considered the minutes of the meeting held on 2 October 2018.

AGREED (unanimously) that the minutes of the meeting held on 2 October 2018 be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

111 WOOD VIEW, THE CLOSE, AVERHAM (18/01421/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration, following a site inspection, which sought the erection of a new dwelling including the demolition of the existing flat roofed garage.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting which detailed correspondence received after the Agenda was published from Planning Committee Members. Following the site visit Members requested clarification on whether the applicant had ownership/control of the boundary hedgerow to the side and rear. The

agent had confirmed that the applicant had ownership of the rear and side boundary hedgerow and agreed that it could be retained to retain privacy between dwellings.

Members considered the application and felt that the proposed dwelling would have an impact on the neighbouring property Pinfold Cottage. There appears to be a 1.5 metre difference in land levels and impacts are further exasperated by the new dwelling being two storeys. The size of the plot is too small for the dwelling. Members considered that it would not preserve or enhance the character and appearance conservation area and felt that it would dominate and be of harm to the amenity of Pinfold Cottage.

AGREED (unanimously) that contrary to Officer recommendation full planning permission be refused for the following reasons:

- i) The impact on the neighbouring property and residential amenity; and
- ii) The proposal would harm the character and appearance of the in the conservation area.

In accordance with paragraph 12.5 of the Planning Protocol, as the motion was against Officer recommendation, a recorded vote was taken.

Councillor	Vote
Mrs K. Arnold	For
R.V. Blaney	For
Mrs A.C. Brooks	For
R.A. Crowe	For
Mrs M. Dobson	For
P. Duncan	Absent
G.P. Handley	For
J. Lee	For
D.R. Payne	For
Mrs P. Rainbow	For
F. Taylor	For
Mrs L.M.J. Tift	For
I. Walker	For
B. Wells	For
Mrs Y. Woodhead	For

112 NOTTINGHAMSHIRE SCOUTS ADVENTURE, HOVERINGHAM ACTIVITY CENTRE, THURGARTON LANE, THURGARTON (18/01298/FULM)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration, following a site inspection, which sought a variation of condition 2, 13 and 14 attached to planning permission 15/01537/FULM.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting which detailed correspondence received after the Agenda was published from Hoveringham Parish Council.

Members considered the application and felt that the works undertaken by the Scout

Association were much improved in relation to the previously considered application. It was felt that any consent should be subject to the fourth container being painted green and the higher fence to the rear of the containers to be reduced in height to match the rest of the site.

AGREED (unanimously) that full planning permission be granted subject to the conditions contained within the report and the following amendment to Condition 12:

The fence to the rear of the containers be reduced in height to match the fence around the site and the fourth container to be painted green to match the three containers on site, works to be completed within three months.

113 ROSE COTTAGE, FARNSFIELD ROAD, BILSTHORPE (18/00629/OUT)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration, following a site inspection, which sought planning permission for the demolition of Rose Cottage and associated outbuildings and the construction of nine new properties and the rebuilding of Rose Cottage.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting which detailed correspondence received after the Agenda was published from a neighbour and agent.

Members considered the application and concerns were raised regarding the one way road system which would be in private ownership and could not be enforced. It was suggested that the road be taken from Farnsfield Road and adopted. Members considered this development with nine dwellings and an unenforceable one way road system not appropriate for the site

AREED (unanimously) that contrary to Officer recommendation outline planning permission be refused for the following reasons:

The limitation of access resulted in a contrived internal layout which was inconsistent and would result in an over intensification development.

In accordance with paragraph 12.5 of the Planning Protocol, as the motion was against Officer recommendation, a recorded vote was taken.

Councillor	Vote
Mrs K. Arnold	For
R.V. Blaney	For
Mrs A.C. Brooks	For
R.A. Crowe	For
Mrs M. Dobson	For
P. Duncan	Absent
G.P. Handley	For
J. Lee	For

D.R. Payne	For
Mrs P. Rainbow	For
F. Taylor	For
Mrs L.M.J. Tift	For
I. Walker	For
B. Wells	For
Mrs Y. Woodhead	For

114 RHED COTTAGE, STATION ROAD, OLLERTON (18/01616/OUT)

The application was withdrawn from the agenda.

115 LAND ADJACENT BRAMLEY HOUSE, BURNMOOR LANE, EGMANTON (18/00787/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration, following a site inspection, which sought the erection of a four bedroom detached house with double garage.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting which detailed correspondence received after the Agenda was published from Nottinghamshire County Council Highways.

Members considered the application and felt that the proposal was not acceptable due to the scale of the dwelling and the impact on the amenity space of Bramley House.

AGREED (with 9 votes For and 5 votes Against) that contrary to Officer recommendation full planning permission be refused for the following reasons:

The scale of the property is inappropriate on this site and would overlook and impact on the amenity space of Bramley House to the rear.

In accordance with paragraph 12.5 of the Planning Protocol, as the motion was against Officer recommendation, a recorded vote was taken.

Councillor	Vote
Mrs K. Arnold	For
R.V. Blaney	For
Mrs A.C. Brooks	For
R.A. Crowe	Against
Mrs M. Dobson	For
P. Duncan	Absent
G.P. Handley	For
J. Lee	For
D.R. Payne	Against
Mrs P. Rainbow	For
F. Taylor	Against
Mrs L.M.J. Tift	For

I. Walker	Against
B. Wells	Against
Mrs Y. Woodhead	For

116 9 THE PADDOCKS, NEWARK (18/01402/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration, following a site inspection, which sought part conversion of 9 The Paddocks to create an additional Chalet Bungalow within the site, the application was a resubmission of withdrawn application reference no. 18/00683/FUL.

Councillor D. Lloyd representing Newark Town Council and local Ward Member for Beacon Ward spoke against the application in accordance with the views of Newark Town Council as contained within the report.

Members considered the application and it was commented that the proposed extensions to create the additional dwelling would be out of character with the plots in the vicinity resulting in incongruous additions which would dominate a prominent corner plot. Members were keen to protect the local distinctiveness of the typical 1970's estate design and layout.

AGREED (with 13 votes For and 1 Abstention) that contrary to Officer recommendation planning permission be refused for the following reasons:

The proposed extensions to create the additional dwelling would be out of character with plots in the vicinity resulting in incongruous additions which would dominate a prominent corner plot. The Planning Committee were keen to protect the local distinctiveness of the typical 1970's estate design and layout.

In accordance with paragraph 12.5 of the Planning Protocol, as the motion was against Officer recommendation, a recorded vote was taken.

Councillor	Vote
Mrs K. Arnold	For
R.V. Blaney	For
Mrs A.C. Brooks	For
R.A. Crowe	For
Mrs M. Dobson	Abstained
P. Duncan	Absent
G.P. Handley	For
J. Lee	For
D.R. Payne	For
Mrs P. Rainbow	For
F. Taylor	For
Mrs L.M.J. Tift	For
I. Walker	For
B. Wells	For
Mrs Y. Woodhead	For

117 NEWARK LORRY PARK (17/01090/FULM)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration, which sought planning permission for the extension of Newark Lorry Park onto adjacent parcels of land which were currently being unused and the provision of a fuel bunker on existing lorry park land. Proposals were intended to accommodate the displacement lorry parking spaces which had been lost due to a neighbouring development.

Members considered the application and it was commented that reports had been taken to the Operational Committees who were all supportive of the developments to this site. It was reported that the lorry park was a much used facility and that Newark town centre also benefited economically. It was considered a crucial gateway to Newark which should be retained and the land maximised to its full potential.

(Councillor F. Taylor left and returned to the meeting during the Officer presentation and took no part in the debate or vote).

AGREED (unanimously) that full planning permission be approved subject to the conditions contained within the report.

118 FUTURE FISHING HARDY'S BUSINESS PARK (18/01118/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration, which sought full planning permission to retain the existing building and use as a Sui Generis Retail Warehouse Club with ancillary B1 (Business) and B8 (Storage and Distribution) uses. The application was retrospective and the building had been in situ since May 2016 according to the planning application forms.

The Business Manager Growth & Regeneration informed the Committee that six car parking spaces and overspill parking for customers could be secured through condition and the applicant was in agreement with that requirement. The Highways Authority raised no objection to the proposed parking arrangements.

Members considered the application and the local Ward Member commented that he would accept the officer recommendation providing that the Planning Authority had the resources to ensure that the recommendations were complied with. The Business Manager Growth & Regeneration confirmed that they had the ability to serve enforcement action on the applicant/company and that three applications had already been taken through enforcement action.

(Councillor F. Taylor left and returned to the meeting during the Officer presentation and took no part in the debate or vote).

AGREED (unanimously) that full planning permission be approved subject to the conditions contained within the report and an additional condition requiring details of site circulation and the demarcation of car parking spaces.

(Councillor J. Lee left the meeting at this point).

119 BROOKLYN, LOWER KIRKLINGTON ROAD, SOUTHWELL (18/01337/RMA)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration, which sought reserved matters for the erection of three dwellings. Approval was sought for the design, siting, scale and layout. Approved reference 17/00383/OUT.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting which detailed correspondence received after the Agenda was published from a local resident; Nottinghamshire County Council Highways Authority and the agent.

Members considered the application and it was commented that the Planning Committee had previously refused the application due to the location of two allocated sites in that vicinity. The application had been approved on appeal. It was therefore commented that the Officers report was correct and that the local need for the dwellings should be demonstrated.

A Member commented that whilst she sympathised with the applicant, Southwell did need two bedroomed properties in the centre of Southwell and not on this location as a car would be needed to drive into the centre of Southwell. The proposed dwellings were large in scale, the application was approved on appeal but was not what was shown.

A Member sought clarification regarding the scale of the dwellings as the report indicated a 50% increase in floor space but then specified that there was no gross difference. The Business Manager Growth and Regeneration confirmed that the Planning Inspectors comments were ambiguous regarding the need element as there was a 2.7% need for five bedroom homes, he had however calculated the need together for the 2, 3 and 4 bedroomed homes.

The Business Manager advised that the larger units proposed were not genuine 4 and 5 bed units and that therefore the need had not been met.

(Councillor J. Lee left the meeting during the Officer presentation and debate and took no part in the vote).

AGREED (unanimously) that planning permission be refused for the reasons contained within the report.

120 2 FORESTRY HOLDINGS, EDWINSTOWE (18/01563/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration, which sought the removal of an existing timber storage building and the erection of a holiday lodge.

Members considered the application and whilst some concern was raised why the applicant wanted to remove an identical timber building and replace it with a similar one, other Members considered the application acceptable and the replacement dwelling would bring the accommodation up to date in quality and would be more

economical to replace the dwelling than repair the old one.

(Councillor P. Handley left and returned to the meeting during the Officer presentation and took no part in the debate or vote).

AGREED (with 8 votes For and 4 votes Against) that planning permission be approved subject to the conditions and reasons contained within the report.

121 MEADOW VIEW, FISKERTON ROAD, ROLLESTON (18/01592/OUT)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration, which sought outline planning permission for the erection of a dormer bungalow on the paddock land.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting which detailed correspondence received after the Agenda was published from the agent.

Members considered the application and felt that the Officer recommendation for refusal was correct. It was commented that reference to the application having to be built in flood zone 1 should be contained in reason 2 for refusal.

AGREED (unanimously) that full planning permission be refused for the reasons contained within the report.

122 LAND TO THE REAR OF FRANKLYN, LOWER KIRKLINGTON ROAD, SOUTHWELL (18/01711/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth & Regeneration, which sought the variation of condition 2 attached to the appeal decision APP/B3030/W/17/317963 for planning permission 17/00623/FUL to amend the proposed floor plans and elevations.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting which detailed correspondence received after the Agenda was published from the agent.

Members considered the application and some Members felt that the application should be refused as it was contrary to Planning Inspectorate conditions 2 and 4, other Members felt that a pragmatic approach should be taken.

AGREED (with 6 votes For, 6 votes Against and 1 Abstention, the Chairman used his casting vote in support of the application) that planning permission be approved subject to the conditions contained within the report.

123 APPEALS LODGED

AGREED that the report be noted.

124 APPEALS DETERMINED

AGREED that the report be noted.

125 QUARTERLY ENFORCEMENT ACTIVITY UPDATE REPORT 1 JULY TO 30 SEPTEMBER 2018

AGREED that the report be noted.

126 EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS AND PUBLIC

There were none.

Meeting closed at 6.20 pm.

Chairman